

**FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT**  
**City of Sumner Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments**

November 2010







**CITY OF SUMNER**  
1104 Maple Street, Suite 250  
Sumner, Washington 98390-1423  
253.299.5530 • Fax: 253.299.5539

Community Development Department  
Paul Rogerson, AICP, Director

November 24, 2010

Dear Reader:

Attached is a copy of the City of Sumner Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments Final Environmental Impact Statement (EIS), prepared in accordance with the State Environmental Policy Act (SEPA). The proposal is to adopt the Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments that consider new growth allocations and a new planning horizon of 2030 to meet the requirements of the Washington State Growth Management Act (GMA). This Final EIS responds to comments received on the Draft EIS and completes the environmental analysis of the Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments.

The proposed Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments address property within the city limits, abutting the Urban Growth Area (UGA) including a proposed expansion area south of State Route (SR) 410 and adjacent to 166th Avenue East (Orton Junction) and an area on the East Hill. The Final EIS considers land use patterns and alternative UGA boundaries for East Hill and the Orton Junction expansion area that would result in a net reduction of the UGA by about 62 acres.

State law requires that likely environmental impacts of land use actions such as the proposed Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments be identified in an EIS. The City is using an integrated SEPA/GMA process in accordance with Washington Administrative Code (WAC) 197-11-210 to 197-11-238. The Draft EIS studied a No Action Alternative and two action alternatives—the UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative and the UGA Modification Alternative. Each alternative was reviewed in terms of the following environmental topics: earth, air quality, surface water, plants and animals, environmental health, land use, plans and policies, cultural resources, population/housing/employment, parks and open space, transportation, capital facilities and public services, and utilities. In addition, the Final EIS qualitatively reviews a Planning Commission Preferred Alternative, which is a hybrid of the two action alternatives. The Preferred Alternative would expand the UGA south of SR 410 in the same manner as the UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative, while reducing the UGA on the East Hill in the same manner as the UGA Modification Alternative. As a hybrid alternative, the Planning Commission Preferred Alternative is within the range of the two action alternatives studied in the Draft EIS. The Draft and Final EIS identify specific environmental impacts of the studied alternatives, as well as methods to mitigate impacts. The Planning Commission Preferred Alternative *did not* approve the private amendment request to expand the Manufacturing/Industrial Center.

If you have any questions or desire clarification of the above, please contact Ryan Windish, Planning Manager, at (253) 299-5524.

Sincerely,

Paul Rogerson, AICP  
Community Development Department



## Title

City of Sumner Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments

## Proposal and Alternatives

To accommodate future population and employment growth, the City of Sumner (City) is proposing the following actions as part of its Comprehensive Plan Update and Amendments:

- Plan for a new comprehensive plan horizon year of 2030.
- Incorporate updated population and employment growth allocations for year 2030.
- Determine appropriate land use patterns to accommodate future growth within the Sumner city limits and the Sumner Urban Growth Area (UGA).
- Consider logical UGA boundaries to the south and east of the city limits.
- Recognize Pierce County’s designated agricultural lands and opportunities for purchase of development rights and transfer of development rights.
- Determine if docket applications should be approved, including:
  - TA-1: Amendment to the Manufacturing/Industrial Center Map Boundary—Fleishmann’s Industrial Park, LLC, applicant;
  - MA-1: Amendment to the UGA boundary (Orton Junction Amendment) and application of commercial and mixed use land uses—City, applicant; and
  - MA-2: Amendment to the UGA boundary (Reducing East Hill Area)—City, applicant.
- Revise City Comprehensive Plan elements and development regulations to address plan horizon and growth, land use plan and zoning changes, and housekeeping and consistency amendments.

To analyze the proposal, the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) studied alternatives including the No Action Alternative and two action alternatives—UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative and UGA Modification Alternative. In addition to these alternatives, the Final EIS qualitatively analyzes a Planning Commission Preferred Alternative, which is a hybrid of the UGA Expansion Alternative and the UGA Modification Alternative, and is within the range defined by these two action alternatives. Each of these alternatives is briefly described below.

### UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative

The UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative would extend the current UGA boundary by adding a 188-acre area south of State Route (SR) 410 in the vicinity of 166th Avenue East and Riverside Drive East. Proposed comprehensive plan land use designations would include General Commercial (GC; approximately 113 acres) and Interchange Commercial (IC; approximately 11 acres)—with a Planned Mixed Use Development (PMUD) overlay to ensure master planning—and Low Density Residential 1 (LDR-1; approximately 64 acres) on either side of the commercial areas. City zoning

would be applied if/when the area is annexed to the city; it is assumed that comparable Pierce County urban zoning would apply prior to annexation.

To address Pierce County policies for agricultural land preservation as well as allowances for transfer and purchase of development rights, this alternative would require:

- a determination that 131 acres of land currently designated Agricultural Resource Lands (ARL) no longer meet the ARL criteria, and
- designation of a commensurate number of acres of land as ARL accompanied by conservation easements to ensure long-term agricultural production to satisfy the policy requirements in the *Alderton-McMillin Community Plan Objective 7A*.

No urban land use development permits would be approved until the development rights are purchased.

To ensure that the area zoned GC is not used for an extensive amount of multifamily residential, which is allowed in the GC zone, the City proposes that the PMUD overlay include a provision that requires a minimum percentage of commercial uses and a maximum percentage of residential uses.

This alternative would approve the request to add the Old Fleischmann Yeast property on the Comprehensive Plan Manufacturing/Industrial Center (MIC) Map.

### **UGA Modification Alternative**

The UGA Modification Alternative would extend the UGA boundary to include only the commercial portion of the Orton Junction expansion area, described under the UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative, and would reduce the extent of the UGA boundary in the East Hill area, between 158th Avenue East extended on the west, Forest Canyon Road to the north, the present UGA boundary on the east, and the City's watershed to the south. The combination of these UGA boundary modifications would result in a net reduction in the total area of UGA of 126 acres. The UGA territory in the East Hill reduction area would revert to Pierce County rural residential designations.

The modified Orton Junction expansion area under this alternative would include GC and IC designations with a PMUD overlay to ensure master planning. No LDR-1 designations would be applied. City commercial zoning would be applied if/when the area is annexed to the city; it is assumed that comparable Pierce County urban zoning would apply prior to annexation.

Similar to the UGA Expansion Alternative, the UGA Modification Alternative would include:

- a PMUD overlay with a provision that requires a minimum amount of commercial uses and a maximum percentage of residential uses, and
- approval of the request to add the Old Fleischmann Yeast property on the Comprehensive Plan MIC Map.

### **No Action Alternative**

For the purpose of this analysis, the No Action Alternative represents the continuation of the City's current Comprehensive Plan and retention of the 2022 planning horizon and growth allocations. The No Action Alternative would not include any amendments to the City Comprehensive Plan Land Use Map, Comprehensive Plan policies, or development regulations, or consideration of any location-specific amendment requests to the City Comprehensive Plan or zoning. It would not

amend City plans to update growth targets consistent with targets that may be adopted by the Pierce County Council. The No Action Alternative is required to be studied under the State Environmental Policy Act (SEPA).

### **Planning Commission Preferred Alternative**

The Planning Commission Preferred Alternative is a hybrid alternative, combining features of the two action alternatives. Similar to the UGA Expansion Alternative, the Preferred Alternative would extend the current UGA boundary by adding a 188-acre area south of SR 410 in the vicinity of 166th Avenue East and Riverside Drive East. Comprehensive plan land use designations in this area would be the same as proposed under the UGA Expansion Alternative.

Similar to the UGA Modification Alternative, the Preferred Alternative would reduce the extent of the UGA boundary in the East Hill area, between 158th Avenue East extended on the west, Forest Canyon Road to the north, the present UGA boundary on the east, and the City's watershed to the south. Lands removed from the UGA by this reduction would revert to Pierce County rural land use designations. Overall, these UGA boundary modifications would result in a net reduction of the total UGA area of 62 acres. Additionally, the Preferred Alternative would deny the request to add the Old Fleischmann Yeast property on the Comprehensive Plan MIC Map.

## **Proponent**

City of Sumner

## **Tentative Date of Implementation**

The date of anticipated implementation of the City Comprehensive Plan and development regulations is November or December 2010. Changes that require Pierce County authorization (ARL de-designation and UGA amendment) would become effective following County approval, tentatively in 2011.

## **Lead Agency**

City of Sumner

## **Responsible Official**

Paul Rogerson, Community Development Director  
City of Sumner  
Community Development Department  
1104 Maple Street, Suite 250  
Sumner, WA 98390-1423  
Phone: (253) 299-5521  
Fax: (253) 299-5509  
paulr@ci.sumner.wa.us

## Contact Person

Ryan Windish, Planning Manager, AICP  
City of Sumner  
Community Development Department  
1104 Maple Street, Suite 250  
Sumner, WA 98390-1423  
Phone: (253) 299-5524  
Fax: (253) 299-5539  
ryanw@ci.sumner.wa.us

## Required Licenses and Approvals

As legislative items, the Planning Commission has authority to make recommendations on comprehensive plan and development regulation amendments. The City Council has the authority to approve such amendments. Pierce County makes decisions regarding UGA boundaries and growth allocations following consultations with local jurisdictions and the Pierce County Regional Council.

In addition, the Washington State Department of Commerce reviews proposed comprehensive plan and development regulation amendments during a 60-day review period prior to adoption. The Puget Sound Regional Council reviews comprehensive plans and in particular transportation element amendments for consistency with regional plans.

## Authors and Principal Contributors

### Principal Authors

ICF International  
710 Second Avenue, Suite 550  
Seattle, WA 98014  
(206) 801-2816

### Contributing Authors

Transpo Group  
11730 118th Avenue NE, Suite 600  
Kirkland, WA 98034  
(425) 821-3665  
(Transportation)

City of Sumner Community Development Department  
See Contact Person above.  
(Plans and Policies; GIS)

## Review Opportunities

The Draft EIS was issued on August 9, 2010, and the public comment period ended on October 8, 2010. Comments received are included in the Final EIS, as well as responses to those comments. The Final EIS is being considered together with the final Comprehensive Plan Amendments and implementing regulation amendment ordinances by the City Council. No review period applies. Pursuant to WAC 197-11-230, a 7-day waiting period does not apply in the case of a final integrated SEPA/Growth Management Act (GMA) document, as there was also a draft integrated SEPA/GMA document. The adoption of the Final EIS and Comprehensive Plan amendments can occur together.

## Final Integrated Comprehensive Plan and Environmental Impact Statement Adoption Date

November 15, 2010

## Final Environmental Impact Statement Issuance

November 24, 2010 (within 10 days of adoption)

## Prior and Future Environmental Review

The City has issued the following three EISs related to its Comprehensive Plan.

- The *Final Environmental Impact Statement—Sumner Comprehensive Plan Update* (for the first update to the original comprehensive plan) was issued on December 22, 1993, to address the Sumner Planning Area including a range of UGA alternatives south of SR 410. The EIS was prepared as part of an integrated process with the GMA Comprehensive Plan.
- The *East Sumner Neighborhood Plan Integrated Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement and Subarea Plan* was issued on March 14, 2001, to address a particular neighborhood within the city limits.
- The *Final Environmental Impact Statement for City of Sumner Comprehensive Plan Update 2004* was issued on June 30, 2005, to address an update of the comprehensive plan to horizon year 2022.

In addition to EISs, the City has prepared an addendum to the 2005 Final EIS for its MIC designation, which was issued May 14, 2009.

Pierce County has also prepared SEPA documents including the *Alderton-McMillin Community Plan and Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement*, issued August 1, 2007, which addressed territory south of SR 410.

As appropriate, these environmental review documents have been considered in the preparation of this EIS.

## Location of Background Information

See Lead Agency and Responsible Official Address listed above.

## Final Environmental Impact Statement Cost

The purchase price of a copy of the Final EIS is based on reproduction costs of printed documents or compact discs (CDs). Hard copies of the Final EIS are available for review at City of Sumner Community Development Department, City Hall, 1104 Maple Street, and at the Sumner Library, 1116 Fryar Ave. The document is posted on the City's website: <http://www.ci.sumner.wa.us/>.

# Contents

---

<b>Chapter 1</b>	<b>Summary</b> .....	<b>1-1</b>
1.1	Purpose of the Proposal.....	1-1
1.2	SEPA Procedures and Public Involvement.....	1-1
1.2.1	Purpose of the EIS .....	1-2
1.2.2	Programmatic and Integrated Analysis .....	1-2
1.2.3	Phased Review .....	1-2
1.2.4	EIS Scoping and Public Comment .....	1-2
1.2.5	Study Area .....	1-3
1.3	Proposed Action, Alternatives, and Objectives.....	1-3
1.3.1	Objectives of the Proposal .....	1-3
1.3.2	UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative.....	1-4
1.3.3	UGA Modification Alternative .....	1-4
1.3.4	No Action Alternative .....	1-5
1.3.5	Planning Commission Preferred Alternative .....	1-5
1.4	Summary of Impacts.....	1-6
1.4.1	Impacts Common to All Alternatives.....	1-6
1.4.2	Summary of Impacts by Alternative .....	1-19
1.5	Mitigation Measures .....	1-40
1.6	Significant Unavoidable Adverse Impacts .....	1-49
1.6.1	Natural Environment.....	1-50
1.6.2	Built Environment.....	1-50
1.6.3	Public Services and Utilities.....	1-52
1.7	Major Issues, Significant Areas of Controversy and Uncertainty, and Issues to be Resolved .....	1-53
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>Description of the Proposal and Alternatives</b> .....	<b>2-1</b>
2.1	Introduction.....	2-1
2.2	Proposal.....	2-1
2.2.1	Growth Management Act and City of Sumner Comprehensive Plan.....	2-1
2.2.2	Growth Allocations, Land Use Capacity, and Efficient Use of Land .....	2-2
2.3	Environmental Review .....	2-4
2.3.1	Study Area .....	2-5
2.3.2	Scope of Review .....	2-5

- 2.3.3 Level of Analysis ..... 2-7
- 2.4 Alternatives ..... 2-10
  - 2.4.1 UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative ..... 2-11
  - 2.4.2 UGA Modification Alternative ..... 2-12
  - 2.4.3 No Action Alternative ..... 2-14
  - 2.4.4 Planning Commission Preferred Alternative ..... 2-15
  - 2.4.5 Comparison of Alternatives ..... 2-16
- 2.5 Benefits and Disadvantages of Delaying the Proposal ..... 2-17
- 2.6 Alternatives Previously Considered and Future Alternatives ..... 2-18
- 2.7 Major Issues to be Resolved ..... 2-19
- Chapter 3 Environmental Review of Preferred Alternative ..... 3-1**
  - 3.1 Earth ..... 3-1
  - 3.2 Air Quality ..... 3-1
  - 3.3 Flooding ..... 3-2
  - 3.4 Water Quality ..... 3-2
  - 3.5 Plants/Animals ..... 3-2
  - 3.6 Noise ..... 3-2
  - 3.7 Explosion Risk ..... 3-3
  - 3.8 Land Use ..... 3-3
  - 3.9 Plans/Policies ..... 3-4
  - 3.10 Population/ Employment ..... 3-4
  - 3.11 Housing ..... 3-5
  - 3.12 Cultural ..... 3-5
  - 3.13 Transportation ..... 3-6
    - 3.13.1 Impacts of the Preferred Alternative ..... 3-6
    - 3.13.2 Mitigation Measures ..... 3-13
  - 3.14 Parks/Recreation ..... 3-16
  - 3.15 City Facilities ..... 3-17
  - 3.16 Fire/Police/Courts ..... 3-17
  - 3.17 Libraries/Schools ..... 3-18
  - 3.18 Water Supply ..... 3-18
  - 3.19 Sanitary Sewer ..... 3-19
  - 3.20 Storm Sewer ..... 3-19
  - 3.21 Solid Waste ..... 3-20
  - 3.22 Utilities ..... 3-20
- Chapter 4 Clarifications and Corrections ..... 4-1**
  - 4.1 Front Matter ..... 4-1

- 4.2 Draft EIS Chapter 1 ..... 4-1
- 4.3 Draft EIS Chapter 2 ..... 4-1
- 4.4 Draft EIS Chapter 3 ..... 4-1
  - 4.4.1 Earth ..... 4-1
  - 4.4.2 Air Quality ..... 4-1
  - 4.4.3 Flooding ..... 4-2
  - 4.4.4 Water Quality ..... 4-2
  - 4.4.5 Plants and Animals ..... 4-2
  - 4.4.6 Noise ..... 4-2
  - 4.4.7 Risk of Explosion ..... 4-3
  - 4.4.8 Land Use ..... 4-3
  - 4.4.9 Plans and Policies ..... 4-4
  - 4.4.10 Population and Employment ..... 4-4
  - 4.4.11 Housing ..... 4-7
  - 4.4.12 Cultural Resources ..... 4-8
  - 4.4.13 Transportation ..... 4-8
  - 4.4.14 Parks and Recreation ..... 4-11
  - 4.4.15 City Facilities ..... 4-11
  - 4.4.16 Fire, Police, and Courts ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.17 Libraries and Schools ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.18 Water Supply ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.19 Sanitary Sewer ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.20 Storm Sewer ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.21 Solid Waste ..... 4-12
  - 4.4.22 Utilities ..... 4-12
- 4.5 Appendices ..... 4-13
- Chapter 5 Responses to Comments ..... 5-1**
  - 5.1 Public Comments ..... 5-1
  - 5.2 Responses to Comments ..... 5-4
- Chapter 6 Acronyms/Abbreviations and References ..... 6-1**
  - 6.1 Acronyms/Abbreviations ..... 6-1
  - 6.2 References ..... 6-2
    - 6.2.1 Printed References ..... 6-2
    - 6.2.2 Personal Communications ..... 6-3
- Chapter 7 Distribution List ..... 7-1**
  - 7.1 Federal, State, Tribal, Regional, County and City Agencies ..... 7-1
    - 7.1.1 Federal Agencies ..... 7-1

7.1.2 State of Washington Agencies ..... 7-1

7.1.3 Tribal..... 7-2

7.1.4 Regional..... 7-2

7.1.5 Counties..... 7-2

7.1.6 Cities ..... 7-2

7.2 Special Districts, Transportation, and Utilities ..... 7-2

7.3 City of Sumner ..... 7-3

7.4 Boards and Associations..... 7-3

7.5 Community Organizations..... 7-3

7.6 Newspapers..... 7-3

7.7 Citizens and Property Owners..... 7-4

**Appendix A. City of Sumner Land Capacity Analysis for the 2010 Comprehensive Plan Amendments**

**Appendix B. Staff Report: Planning Commission Recommendations**

**Appendix C. Record of Planning Commission Deliberations**

**Appendix D. Proposed Amendments Associated with the Planning Commission Preferred Alternative**

**Appendix E. “What If” Scenario Transportation Analyses**

**Appendix F. Corrections to the Draft EIS Table of Contents**

**Appendix G. Puget Sound Regional Council Comprehensive Plan Reporting Tool**

**Appendix H. Orton Junction Market Study**

# Tables

---

Table 1-1.	Land Capacity under Alternatives Compared to 2022 and 2030 Growth Allocations.....	1-13
Table 1-2.	Parks and Recreation Level of Service Deficiencies .....	1-15
Table 1-3.	City Facility Space—Existing and 2030 Demand (Square Feet).....	1-16
Table 1-4.	Summary Comparison of Impacts Unique to Each Alternative.....	1-20
Table 1-5.	Summary of Potential Mitigation Measures in addition to Incorporated Plan Features and Applicable Regulations and Commitments .....	1-40
Table 2-1.	Growth Allocations for Current Plan Area (City Limits and UGA).....	2-3
Table 2-2.	Scoping Comment Topics and Response or Location Addressed in Draft and Final Environmental Impact Statements .....	2-6
Table 2-3.	Sumner Integrated SEPA/GMA Plan and EIS.....	2-9
Table 2-4.	Allocations and Land Capacity—UGA Expansion Alternative (Orton Junction) .....	2-12
Table 2-5.	Allocations and Land Capacity—UGA Modification Alternative .....	2-13
Table 2-6.	Land Capacity and Growth Allocations—No Action Alternative.....	2-14
Table 2-7.	Land Capacity and Growth Allocations—Preferred Alternative .....	2-15
Table 2-8.	Alternative Comparison .....	2-17
Table 3-1.	Comparison of Forecast PM Peak-Hour Traffic Volumes .....	3-7
Table 3-2.	Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) Summary <sup>1</sup> .....	3-9
Table 3-3.	Forecast Intersection Peak-Hour Level of Service—Current Plan Area Locations .....	3-10
Table 3-4.	Forecast Intersection Peak-Hour Level of Service—Orton Junction Expansion Area .....	3-11
Table 3-5.	Parks and Recreation Level of Service Deficiencies—Preferred Alternative .....	3-17
Table 3-6.	City Facility Space—Existing and 2030 Demand (Square Feet).....	3-17
Table 3.8-2.	Development in the Pipeline (Corrected).....	4-3
Table 3.10-3.	Land Capacity under Alternatives Compared to 2022 and 2030 Growth Allocations.....	4-7

Table 3.11-9. Dwelling Capacity and Mix (Corrected)..... 4-8

Table 3.13-4. Comparison of Forecast PM Peak-Hour Traffic Volumes (Corrected)..... 4-9

Table A-1. Current Growth Allocations for Current Plan Area (City Limits and UGA) (Corrected) .....4-13

Table 5-1. Public Comment Letters Received ..... 5-1

Table 5-2. Public Hearing Comments Received—August 30, 2010..... 5-2

Table 5-3. Responses to Comments ..... 5-4

## Figures

	<b>Follows Page</b>
Figure 2-1. Study Areas.....	2-19
Figure 2-2. Old Fleischmann Yeast Property Site (1115 Zehnder Street) .....	2-19
Figure 2-3. UGA Expansion (Orton Junction) Alternative.....	2-19
Figure 2-4. UGA Modification Alternative .....	2-19
Figure 2-5. Comprehensive Plan Land Use (No Action) .....	2-19
Figure 2-6. Zoning Map (No Action) .....	2-19
Figure 2-7. Preferred Alternative .....	2-19
Figure 3.8-2 Developments in the “Pipeline” (corrected).....	4-13
Figure 3.10-3. Current Employment—Sumner .....	on page 4-5
Figure 3.10-4. Forecast Employment—FAZ 900 .....	on page 4-5
Figure 3.10-5. Existing Employment in Sumner-Pacific Proposed MIC.....	on page 4-6
Figure 3.22-1 Natural Gas and Electrical Facilities Map (Corrected) .....	4-13